

# The Good, Bad, and Ugly: Comparisons and Contrasts of the Native American culture after the Lewis and Clark expedition

**Title:** The Good, Bad, and Ugly: Comparisons and Contrasts of the Native American culture after the Lewis and Clark expedition.

**Subtitle or Challenge question:** Students will compare and contrast Native American culture and demonstrate how it was affected by the land being obtained in the Louisiana Purchase by the American government.

**Grade Level:** Grades 5-8

**Topic Subject:** Lewis and Clark and the Louisiana Purchase

**Author Information:**

Robin Ferrell [ferrero2@tulsaschools.org](mailto:ferrero2@tulsaschools.org)

Mitchell Elementary School, Tulsa, Oklahoma

**Lesson Type:** Group, individual, or both

**Duration:** 90 – 120 minutes

**Essential Questions:**

In the Oklahoma History Museum in Oklahoma City, Oklahoma, is a treaty signed by President Thomas Jefferson given by Lewis and Clark to the Otoe Indians.

1. How do you think the Native Americans' lives changed after the Louisiana Purchase?
2. What advantages and disadvantages would they have under American government?

**Prior Knowledge:** Students will have read about Jefferson's Louisiana Purchase and of Lewis and Clark's expedition through Indian Territory trying to find a waterway to the Pacific Ocean. This may include researching these electronic resources:

Jefferson Prepares for the Lewis and Clark Expedition

<https://classroom.monticello.org/view/middle/74478/>

Lewis and Clark Expedition page at Monticello.org <http://www.nationalgeographic.com/lewisandclark/>

National Geographic Lewis and Clark website <http://www.nationalgeographic.com/lewisandclark/>

### **National Standards:**

#### **From C3 Framework for Social Studies State Standards**

<http://www.socialstudies.org/system/files/c3/C3-Framework-for-Social-Studies.pdf>

D2.Civ.6.3-5. Describe ways in which people benefit from and are challenged by working together, including through government, workplaces, voluntary organizations, and families.

D2.Civ.6.6-8. Describe the roles of political, civil, and economic organizations in shaping people's lives.

#### **Oklahoma State Social Studies Standards**

[http://www.ok.gov/sde/sites/ok.gov.sde/files/documents/files/Social%20Studies%](http://www.ok.gov/sde/sites/ok.gov.sde/files/documents/files/Social%20Studies%20K%20Academic%20Standards_3-4-15.pdf)

[20OK%20Academic%20Standards\\_3-4-15.pdf](http://www.ok.gov/sde/sites/ok.gov.sde/files/documents/files/Social%20Studies%20K%20Academic%20Standards_3-4-15.pdf)

Grade 5.5.3 – Examine the transformative impact of the *Louisiana Purchase* in 1803 upon the American system in regards to the explorations by Lewis and Clark and the concept of Manifest Destiny as America expanded westward.

Grade 8.4.6.C – Examine the concept of Manifest Destiny as a motivation and justification for westward expansion, including the impact upon Native American culture and tribal lands.

**Objectives/Rationale:** Students will be able to compare and contrast Native American cultural changes after the Indian tribes encounter Lewis and Clark during the Corps of Discovery. Students will also study primary sources to explore President Jefferson's role to acquire the exploration party and give them supplies in correspondence with Vice President Madison and the United States Congress. This lesson would work in the curriculum when Thomas Jefferson's presidency is studied.

A warmup activity:

**Introduction Activity from the National Archives** <http://docsteach.org/activities/77>

This activity from the National Archives can be used as an introduction or for a closer study of the Lewis & Clark Expedition. Students will learn that the United States purchased the Louisiana Territory in 1803 and President Thomas Jefferson sent Lewis and Clark to explore west of the Mississippi River in 1804, though the land was already inhabited and politically complicated. Students will analyze primary sources demonstrating various political interests in the West, including the Spanish, French, British, and those of

several Native American groups, and place them on a historic map of the West (created for the centennial of the Louisiana Purchase).

A concluding activity is where students and/or groups develop and present a short electronic presentation like a PowerPoint or Prezi demonstrating a Venn diagram comparing and contrasting Native American Culture before and after acquisition of the Louisiana Purchase by the U.S.

**Outcomes:** Students will better explain the advantages and disadvantages that the Native Americans experienced when they became citizens under the U.S. after the Louisiana Purchase.

**Steps:**

Students will have prior knowledge of President Thomas Jefferson's acquisition of the Louisiana Purchase and the geography expanding the U.S. in 1803 and Lewis and Clark's expedition. They may have the chance to view Jefferson treaties in local or national museums.

Students will use computers to read and analyze Jefferson's confidential letter to Congress regarding the Lewis and Clark Expedition (1803) at <http://www.ourdocuments.gov/doc.php?flash=true&doc=17>

Utilizing the poplet ap, <https://popplet.com/> , students will rewrite in their own words what these phrases, or any of the teacher's choosing, from Jefferson's letter mean:

1. "The Indian tribes residing within the limits of the United States, have, for a considerable time, been growing more and more uneasy at the constant diminution of the territory they occupy,"
2. "In order peaceably to counteract this policy of theirs, and to provide an extension of territory which the rapid increase of our numbers will call for,"
3. "and thereby prove to themselves (Native Americans) that less land and labor will maintain them in this, better than in their former mode of living."

Teachers will use computers to have students complete the interactive National Archives activity <http://docsteach.org/activities/77>

Students will draw a Venn diagram comparing and contrasting the Native Americans views of advantages and disadvantages of living under U.S. control listing 3 items in complete sentences in each part of the diagram. These may include disease, medicines, tools, weapons, furs, and other items brought by one side to the other. Other items discussed may include land acquisition, animals, plants, and minerals.

Students in 5th grade will write a 5 sentence paragraph comparing and contrasting the advantages and disadvantages listed above. The paragraph will have a topic sentence, 3 detail sentences, and a concluding sentence utilizing 2 sources. One source must be a primary source.

Students in 8th grade will write a 5 paragraph essay comparing and contrasting the advantages and disadvantages. The essay will contain 1 introductory paragraph, 3 detail paragraphs, and a concluding paragraph utilizing 3 – 4 sources. Two sources must be primary sources.

They will also create a PowerPoint or Prezi presentation which includes their writing, supported by primary sources. The paragraph or essay will be cited correctly. The presentations given to the class will be assessed by the rubric below.

### Rubric for Assignment

Category	10 Outstanding	9 Very Good	8 Meets Standards	7 Needs Improvement	6 Unsatisfactory
<b>Historically Correct &amp; Thorough</b>	All required elements are present. Abundant additional information is also provided. All information is historically accurate.	All required elements are present as are one or two additional pieces of information. All information is historically accurate.	All required elements are present. All information is historically accurate.	One required element is missing or inaccurate.	More than one required piece of information is missing or inaccurate.
<b>Writing Organization</b>	Sentences/paragraphs are set as required. Each has a topic sentence, supporting details, & a concluding sentence. Transitional words & phrases help link ideas & paragraphs. Topic is methodically developed with facts, concrete details, or quotations. Writing is exceptionally clear & coherent.	Sentences/paragraphs are set as required. Each has a topic sentence, supporting details, & a concluding sentence. Transitional words & phrases help link ideas & paragraphs. Topic is thoroughly developed with facts.	Sentences/paragraphs are set as required. Each has a topic sentence, supporting details and a concluding sentence.	Sentence/paragraphs are set as required. Most have a topic sentence, supporting details, and a concluding sentence.	Sentences/paragraphs are poorly organized. Most lack topic sentences, or supporting details, or concluding sentences.
<b>Writing Coherence</b>	Writing style exceeds grade level expectations & is appropriate for informational text. Extensive use of academic vocabulary is above grade level expectations.	Writing is very clear and coherent. Writing style is appropriate for informational text. Academic vocabulary is used correctly.	Writing is clear and coherent. Writing style is appropriate for informational text.	Writing is occasionally unclear or confusing. Some parts of writing may not be appropriate for informational text.	Writing is often unclear and confusing. Writing style is not appropriate for informational text.
<b>Mechanics: Spelling, Punctuation, &amp; Capitalization</b>	No mistakes are made in spelling, punctuation, or capitalization. Student demonstrates	No mistakes are made in spelling, punctuation, or capitalization.	One to five mistakes are made in spelling, punctuation, or capitalization.	Five to ten mistakes are made in spelling, punctuation, or capitalization.	More than ten mistakes are made in spelling, punctuation, or capitalization.

above grade level skill in spelling, capitalization, and punctuation.

**Bibliography/ Works Cited**

Two or more resources, beyond what is required, are utilized correctly.

One additional resource, beyond the required resources, is utilized correctly.

The minimum amount of resources are used for the assignment, and they meet guidelines required for electronic and primary sources.

One of the required resources is not used or listed in the bibliography OR resources are listed without the proper format.

No resources are listed.

**Primary Sources**

List of Indian Presents Purchased by Meriwether Lewis in Preparation for the Expedition to the West <http://docsteach.org/documents/300353/detail?menu=closed&mode=search&sort By=relevance&q=300353>

Letter from President Jefferson to Vice President Madison, 16 August 1803, requesting Congress to enlarge the “Indian fund” to explore the country and determine its geography. <http://founders.archives.gov/documents/Madison/02-05-02-0332>

Letter from Jefferson to Madison, 24 August 1803, listing Louisiana as ceded by France and now part of the U.S. <http://founders.archives.gov/documents/Madison/02-05-02-0362>

**Enrichment Activity for 8th Grade from National Archives**

Indian Nations vs. Settlers on the American Frontier: 1786 – 1788 where students compare and contrast documents from the Revolutionary written by a combined group of Native American tribes and an American territorial governor. Students will analyze

the documents to determine how the two sides differed in opinion about the political role of Indians tribes and land claims.

<http://docsteach.org/activities/12791/detail>

